

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CO-CURRICULAR ENVIRONMENT OF PRIVATE AND PUBLIC SECTOR SCHOOLS AT PRIMARY LEVEL IN PAKISTAN

په پاکستان كې په ابتدائي كچه دسرڪاري او پرائيويٽ ښوونځيو دهم نصابي ماحول تقابلي جائزه

¹ Naveed Ahmad Taseer ² Dr. Muhammad Imadu-ud.din Akbar ³ Nargis Sultana

Abstract

Primary schooling is the object of the first essentiality in the life of each nation and every person. School is such a unique environment where some of the qualities of life and the education of certain types of activities and occupations are given for the purpose that the development of the child is in the desired direction. So, the proper educational necessities matter for the appropriate development of an educational carrier. As the educational environment of government and private schools are different, the researchers have analyzed them in a proper statistical way. The researchers compared the medium of instruction, student-teacher ratio, enrolment strategies, and co-curricular activities at 20 government and 20 private schools obtained after random sampling. Findings revealed that private schools have better student-teacher ratios, better enrolment strategies, and better teaching and learning environments than government schools.

Keywords: Government schools, private schools, enrolment strategies, co-curricular activities, medium of instruction, student-teacher ratio.

¹ PhD Scholar, Institute of Education and Research, University of the Punjab (PU), Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. taseer642nat1@gmail.com

² Associate Professor, Department of Management Sciences, National University of Modern Languages (NUML) Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan. dr.imad@numl.edu.pk

³ PhD Scholar, Division of Education, University of Education, Lahore. nnargis69@yahoo.com

1. Introduction

The fate of Pakistan is being built in its class at this time. We believe that this is not a miracle. Education in this world based on science and craft science determines the level of happiness, welfare, and safety. The primary level has special significance in the entire process of education. It is the stage when the foundation for personality development is kept. In this stage, the rituals inserted in the child become part of their personality. The more diverse and rich experiences the child will get, the development will be equally effective. In this condition, youngsters develop patterns, search, curiosity, and analysis. Primary, intermediate, and tertiary education are all available in our nation. A child's first years of schooling provide the groundwork for their future academic and social development. It is the bedrock upon which the whole educational system rests.

Primary education is the object of first necessity in the life of each nation and every person. These are the first stairs that successfully reach a nation's desired goal by crossing it successfully. It is said that the closer the relationship is with the national life, the primary education is not the same as the secondary and the higher education. The national ideology of primary education and the contribution of the character are contributed significantly. Primary education is not related to any particular class or person but the entire population. It has every contact with every person's life at every step (Shrivastav, 2007).

Pakistan has a special place in the third world's developing countries. Requirements of our country needs, numerous fields' progress and accomplishments have an orientation on our life; however numerous nations of the world additionally see us as far as expectation. As it is known, the cause of the progression of any country lies in the release of obligations by its natives by the commitment to their country. On the other hand, improving ethics, quality of life, and natural living conditions are from being educated. Illiteracy is a curse that is not erasing in Pakistan. To reduce this illiteracy curse, government and non-governmental organizations are being created in our country. The state and efforts are also being made to bring quality education. For this, the Ministry of Education is taking many steps in the development of primary education.

School is such a particular environment where some of the qualities of life and the education of certain types of activities and occupations are given for the purpose that the development of the child is in the desired direction. These educational institutions affect human life and human life education institutions. Education institutions or schools have a profound influence on society and society on schools, and both determine the nature of each other. Primary education makes the kids versatile to the earth and builds a feeling of common altruism and collaboration. The physical and mental development, development of language, arts, and music, by developing the ability of self-expression, making them self-sufficient, citizenship in them, develops qualities and creates a sense of ethics in them (NEP, 1986). Kothari Commission (1964-66) has written in its report regarding the objectives of primary education that the objective of modern education is to enable the child to cope with the circumstances of future life by providing physical and mental training in such a way to do that it can become a useful citizen.

1.1 Justification of the Study

Primary education is the most critical stage of the life of a child. Education at the primary level of a child is the milestone of his life in which he builds up the beautiful building. The entire development of the child depends upon this education. After reviewing related literature and various sources, the basic aim of primary education is to strengthen the foundation of a prosperous, potential, creative and innovative society and a developed nation. In this series, primary education is pure growth. Development is the equal responsibility of government and private schools to enhance primary education.

There is too much difference in the co-curricular environment of government and private primary schools at different levels. Co-curricular activities are an umbrella term consisting of the following four aspects: medium of instruction, student-teacher ratio, enrolment status, and co-curricular activities in government and private schools of Pakistan. A few studies were conducted on different aspects of primary education in Pakistan, but few studies related to the current topic. Due to these reasons, the investigator planned to undertake a comparative study to analyze the status of government and private schools at the primary level in Pakistan.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

In the present study, the researchers compared the government and private primary schools in Pakistan with particular reference to the status of government and private schools, medium of instruction, student-teacher ratio, enrolment status, and co-curricular activities in government and private schools in Pakistan.

1.3 Research Objectives

The research aims to:

- i. Reveal the enrolment status of private and government schools at the Primary level.
- ii. Compare the co-curricular activities organized by the private and government schools at the Primary level.

1.4 Research Question

Based on the objectives, this research proposed the following questions:

- i. What is the enrolment status of private and government schools at the Primary level?
- ii. What type of co-curricular activities are organized by the private and government schools at the primary level?

2. Literature Review

The significance of related literature cannot be denied in any research. It is a significant part of any study that functions as a quick post concerning the work finished in the field and choosing the holes lacking in the field of study. It helps in understanding the possibilities of issues. Besides this, a review of related literature intends to position, read thoroughly, and review the past and estimated writing of literature review about the arranged study. The time spent in such a study is constantly an intelligent work.

A study of primary education in Marathwada was carried out by Gogate (1984). The study's goal was to contemplate the offices accessible in primary schools, subjective and quantitative development of students and teachers' responsibilities, reasons for drop-out and stagnation, accomplishment, and the enrolment pattern of girls in necessary training. For this research, 244 regular schools and 53 specialty schools were considered. Before 1948, most schools were governed by the Nazam's daily schedule. Non-formal education was available in mosques, path sales, and the bequests of large landowners during the period. As many as 10,293 schools and 30,942 instructors and students were in operation from 1984 to 1985. There were five 14000 female understudies and 30,942 male understudies in attendance. In rural and urban areas, there was just one instructor.

Primary education in Sundargarh district in India was studied by Naik and Sipra (1992) for the following purposes: To check the progress made by Sundargarh district primary education since independence, to research the facilities provided in primary schools, and the role of local leaders in promoting and developing primary education, to identify the problems that primary schools face and explain them. A total of 203 schools were chosen to represent all of the managements from among the 17 blocks. A questionnaire and interview schedule were used to collect data. Orrisa's Sundargarh district grew primary school enrollment and the number of schools and instructors between 1951 and 1988. A shortage of playground equipment, structures, games, educational resources, and incentives was also uncovered throughout the investigation. It was also discovered that excellent schools existed in areas where local leaders were actively interested in education.

Khatti, Munshi & Mirza (2010) conducted a study on "Role of Private Schools in Promotion of Education Special Focusing on Physical Resources, Human Resources and other Facilities of Badin District" and main objectives of the research were: to investigate the availability of the physical and human resource in private schools. It was found that the physical resources and human resources provided by the private schools played a better role in promoting education.

Supramaniam, Kularajasingam, and Sharmin (2019) analyzed the determining factors (popularity and quality of school, future option, parents' annual income, and qualification of

parents) that significantly influence parents' decision of choosing a private school. The results showed that the popularity and quality of the school, future options, parents' annual income, and parents' qualifications had a significant influence on parents' choice of choosing private schools. The study's findings also indicated a positive correlation between school quality and the popularity of private schools.

Sofi et al. (2017) compared the government and private schools in Jammu & Kashmir. They found that private schools had a lower enrolment of SC and ST students than government schools. It was also found that there were similar differences in attendance of teachers in government and private schools. However, private schools had a lower pupil-teacher ratio. It was found that there were few consisted differences in infrastructure in both the government and private schools. It was also found that government schools teachers had more salaries than private schools teachers.

Farooq (2017) reported in his study that the unfriendly environment of the school, unattended difficulties in learning, and lack of co-curricular activities become reasons for the drop-out of students from the schools. He indicated that for increasing the enrolment of the students, neat and clean classrooms with decoration, playground facilities with sports materials, laboratories, teaching-learning materials, and kind and skillful teachers are required in the schools.

Dixit and Garg (2017) analyzed the academic achievement and academic adjustment of Government and Private School Students. This study revealed that government and private school students differ in academic achievement and adjustment. Private school students had better academic achievement and adjustment than government school students. The gap in previous studies enforces to compare the government and private primary schools in Pakistan with particular reference to the status of government and private schools, enrolment strategy, and co-curricular activities in government and private schools in Pakistan.

3. Research Methodology

Best (1995) defined research methodology, "Research design is the arrangement of conditions for collection and analysis of data in a manner that aims to combine reliance to the research purpose with economy in procedure."

3.1 Research Method

To gather data for a study, researchers might use a variety of approaches. A method's selection must be made based on its goal, aims, and problem nature to be successful in the research. Using an experimental approach to study is essential any time hypotheses and experiences must be validated; research cannot be completed without a sound experimental approach. Whenever you have to study the historical background and occupation, an attempt is made to see the relevance in his present. Then in such a situation, the historical method is used for research work. Whenever the ideology of the education philosopher is studied about any other education philosopher or the relevance of the present, then in this situation, the philosophical method is used in the research work and when the conditions of any current education and its development. Suppose the attempt is made to look at the order. In that case, the survey method should be used in such a situation because the survey is related to research and development. So, in the present study survey method was used by the investigator.

3.2 Population and Sample

Twenty private and twenty government primary schools from Islamabad Capital Territory, Pakistan, were selected as the study sample. All this selection is made by following the random sampling technique.

4. Data Analysis

Marshall and Rossman (1990) said, "Data analysis brings order, structure, and meaning to the mass of collected data. It is a messy, ambiguous, time-consuming, creative and fascinating process. It does not proceed linearly; it is not neat. Data analysis is a search for the answer about the relationship among categories of data." According to Kothari (1989), "The term analysis refers to

the computation of measures and searching for relationship patterns among data-groups.” Data analysis in research work is considered an important step and heart of the research.

When the data is acquired, it is raw, but it becomes information when organized in a meaningful way. Data analysis and interpretation are the foundational foundations of all scientific endeavors. The researchers can conclude the data acquired via the interpretation process. To put it another way, interpretation is a way to understand better the components that seem to explain whatever has been observed by the researcher in the study. As a result of interpretation, a theoretical framework for further investigation may be developed.

4.1 Medium of Instruction

The Medium of Instruction used in government and private schools at the primary level is as follows:

Table 1. Medium of Instruction used at the primary level

Type of School	Medium of Instruction		
	Urdu	English	Bilingual
Government	17 (85%)	-	3 (15 %)
Private	3 (15%)	10 (50%)	7 (35%)

Table 1 shows that in 85 percent of government schools, the medium of instruction was Urdu. In 15 percent of government schools, the medium of instruction was bilingual. In comparison, in 15 percent of private schools, the medium of instruction was Urdu. In 50 percent of private schools medium of instruction was English, and in 35 percent, the medium of instruction was bilingual.

It may be concluded that in a maximum of 17 government schools (85 percent), the medium of instruction was Urdu. On the contrary, the majority (10 schools- 50 percent) of private schools use the medium of instruction as English. Further, it may be concluded that in 35 percent of private schools, the medium of instruction was Bilingual. No government school was found where the medium of instruction was English.

4.2 Student-Teacher Ratio

The student-teacher ratio in government and private schools is shown below in Table 2:

Table 2. Student-Teacher Ratio

Type of School	Total Students	Total Teachers Working in Schools	Ratio
Government	21235	1353	31:2
Private	4825	354	27:2

Table 2 reveals the student-teacher ratio of government and private schools. The table shows that the student-teacher ratio is 31:2 in government schools at the primary level while the student-teacher ratio is 27:2 in private schools. It may be concluded that private schools had a better student-teacher ratio than the government schools at the primary level.

4.3 Enrolment Strategies

The status of any institution depends upon the enrolment of the students. Every institution takes some steps and strategies for increasing the enrolment of the students. The interpretation and analysis of data regarding steps taken by the government and private schools are shown in the following table:

Table 3. Steps Taken by Schools to Increase Students Enrolment

Item No.	Steps taken by Schools	Government Schools		Private Schools	
		Yes	No	Yes	No

1	Door to Door Survey	-	20 (100%)	15 (75%)	5 (25%)
2	Spread awareness regarding Govt. Schemes and facilities	13 (65%)	7 (35%)	8 (40%)	12 (60%)
3	Co-operation from SMC/Community/Parents	19 (95%)	1 (5%)	16 (80%)	4 (20%)
4	Advertisement	12 (60%)	8 (40%)	17 (85%)	3 (15%)
5	Display achievement of the students and schools	20 (100%)	-	20 (100%)	-
6	Organization of tour and trip	5 (25%)	15 (75%)	17 (85%)	3 (15%)
7	Use of Social Media	7 (35%)	13 (65%)	20 (100%)	-

Item 1 of Table 3 shows that none of the government schools conducted a door-to-door survey for admission to increase the enrolment of the students. On the other hand, 15 (75 percent) private schools conducted door-to-door surveys for admission to increase the students' enrollment.

Item 2 shows that 13 (65 percent) government schools spread awareness among the parents regarding different government schemes and facilities. In comparison, 8 (40 percent) private schools spread awareness among the parents regarding different government schemes and facilities for the students.

Item 3 shows that 19 (95 percent) government schools took the cooperation from School Management Committee (SMC), the community, and parents to increase students enrolment in the schools. 8 (40 percent) private schools took cooperation from the community and parents to increase enrolment of the students in the schools.

Item 4 shows that 12 (60 percent) government schools resorted to the advertisement for admission. On the other hand, 17 (85 percent) private schools resorted to the advertisement for admission, and 3 (15 percent) private schools did not resort to the advertisement. The investigator deeply observed that private schools spent more money on advertisement and publicity than government schools. However, it was also observed that principles of the private schools spent the money on the advertisement with the help of school funds for the enrolment of the students.

Item 5 shows that 20 (100 percent) government schools displayed the achievement of the students and schools to increase the enrolment of the students and attract the parents and students towards government schools. Similarly, 20 (100 percent) private schools displayed the achievement of students and schools to increase students' enrollment and attract the parents and students to private schools. It may be concluded that all the government and private schools displayed the achievement of students and schools to increase the students' enrollment and attract the parents.

Item 6 shows that 5 (25 percent) government schools organized tours and trips for the students so that students may get a chance for the outing. It is less because of government restrictions. 17 (85 percent) private schools organized tours and trips for the students, but 3 (15 percent) private schools did not organize tours and trips. It may be concluded that top government schools did not organize tours and trips for the students. In contrast, maximum private schools organized tours and trips.

Item 7 shows that 7 (35 percent) government schools used social media to publicize the schools. On the contrary, 20 (100 percent) private schools used social media to publicize their schools. All the private schools used social media to publicize their schools, while only 7 government schools did the same. In comparing government and private schools, it was also found that private schools took more steps and made more efforts to increase the enrolment of the students. Further, it was seen that maximum private schools assumed that such activities were always helpful to increase the students' enrolment.

4.4 Co-curricular Activities

Students of primary schools are at the age of growth stage. Their physical, academic, mental, social, moral, emotional, spiritual, and all aspects of life develop at this stage. The

development of all these aspects of the life of the students is possible only through co-curricular activities in the school. Co-curricular activities organized in government and private schools at the primary level are interpreted through the following tables:

Table 4. Co-curricular Activities Organized by Government and Private Schools

Item . No	Co-curricular Activities	Type of School			
		Government		Private	
		Yes	No	Yes	No
1	Daily Morning Assembly	18 (90%)	2 (10%)	14 (70%)	6 (30%)
2	Morning assembly Activities	18 (90%)	2 (10%)	14 (70%)	6 (30%)
3	Prayer	17 (85%)	3 (15%)	16 (80%)	4 (40%)
4	Thought of the day	14 (70%)	6 (30%)	15 (75%)	5 (25%)
5	News Reading	9 (45%)	11 (55%)	15 (75%)	5 (25%)

Table 4 shows the co-curricular activities organized in the morning assembly by the government and private schools. The table shows that 18 (95 percent) government and 14 (70%) private schools organized morning assembly and morning assembly activities. It may be concluded that most government schools organized morning assembly compared to private schools.

Item 3 in Table 4 shows that 17 (85 percent) government schools organized prayers for the students, and 16 (80 percent) private schools offered prayer in daily assembly proceedings. Most of them do the “Lab p Ati h Dua Ban k Tamannah Meri” in the daily proceedings of assemblies.

Item 4 in Table 4 states that in 14 (70 percent) government schools wrote the thought of the day on the blackboard by the students, and 15 (75 percent) private schools wrote the thought of the day on the blackboard by the students or tell that in daily assembly proceedings.

Item 5 in Table 4 states that 9 (45 percent) government schools do news reading. On the other hand, 15 (75 percent) private schools read the news to students in daily assembly proceedings.

Government schools performed better than private schools in conducting assemblies. On the contrary, private schools conducted more activities after the morning assembly than government schools. During the study, it was also observed that the national anthem is also sung in all the government and private schools daily in the morning assembly.

5. Conclusion

Based on the study results, it may be concluded that government and private schools have many differences in many aspects like availability of teachers, student-teacher ratio, enrolment of the students, and co-curricular activities. Findings reveal that private schools have better infrastructure facilities, better student-teacher ratios, and better enrolment. On the other hand, government schools perform well in co-curricular activities at assemblies. In short, private schools have better teaching-learning environments than government schools. It is recommended that researchers conduct similar findings on different schools, case studies at schools, and add other variables to conduct future studies.

References

- Best, J. W. (1977). *Research in Education*. Second Edition Reprint, New Delhi: Pearson Prentice-Hall of India Pvt. Ltd.
- Dixit, A. K. & Garg, N. (2017). A comparative study of government and private school students on their academic achievement and academic adjustment *International Journal of Humanities, Arts, Medicine and Sciences (BEST: IJHAMS)*, 5(4), 55-60. Retrieved from: https://issuu.com/bestjournals/docs/8_-_ijhams_-_a_comparative_study_of
- Farooq, M. S. (2017). Voices of Primary School Dropouts' about their decision of Leaving School, *Journal of primary Education*, 26(2), 95-113. Retrieved from: http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/JEE/PDF/7_v26_2_16.pdf
- Gogate, S.B. (1984). *A study of Primary Education in Marathwada*, a project undertaken by the Swami Ramanand Teerth Research Institute, Aurangabad, in collaboration with the IIE, Pune.
- Khatti, M, Munshi.P & Mirza, N (2010) Potential of Private school in providing Quality Education in District badin, *The Sindh University Journal of Education* 40(2010-11), 1-16. Retrieved from: <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1079988.pdf>
- Kothari, C.R. (2006). *Quantitative Techniques*, Second Reprint. New Delhi: Vikas Publishing House Pvt. Ltd.
- Naik, & Shipra, (1992). *Development of the primary education in Sundargarh district, Orissa with special emphasis on the role played by local leadership*. Ph.D. thesis in education, in Fifth survey of educational research (1988-1992), New Delhi: NCERT.
- Shrivastav, M. (2007). Parathmik Shiksha: Badhta Paryas-Ghatta Satar, *Kurukshetra*, 11(01), 22-25.
- Sofi, MA et. Al (2017). A comparative study of government and private schools in Jammu and kasmir, *International Journal of Applied Research*, 3(9) 374-377.
- Suppramaniam, S., Kularajasingam, J., & Sharmin, N. (2019). Factors Influencing Parents Decision in Selecting Private Schools in Chittagong City, Bangladesh, *International Journal of Recent Technology and Engineering (IJRTE)*, 7(5S), 318-330. Retrieved from: <https://www.ijrte.org/wp-content/uploads/papers/v7i5s/ES2161017519.pdf>